

Effective Consequences

by

Jenelle Elizabeth Poer

A capstone project submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of  
Master of Arts in Education.

Hamline University

Saint Paul, Minnesota

November 2022

Capstone Project Facilitator: Betsy Parrish

Content Expert: Cathy Maki

## **Project Summary**

This project is a professional development (PD) designed for teachers who serve students under eighteen. It has been created as a response to the research question: *what are the most vital parts of effective consequences?* It aims to help develop behavioral management skills for establishing and upholding classroom expectations in a way that allows consequences to change student behavior, while minimizing or eliminating negative side effects to the students.

This professional development has been developed with the principles of Darling-Hammond et al. (2017), and Mezirow (2000) in mind. Due to this, it will be comprised of four sessions over four months. According to both Darling-Hammond et al. and Mezirow, it is key to allow participants to reflect and put into practice what they have learned. In addition, the sessions will promote participant involvement and contribution, as social processing is shown to increase the effectiveness of professional developments (Darling-Hammond, Hyler, Gardner, 2017).

For the content of the sessions, the vital elements of effective consequences have been boiled down to four: clarity, teamwork, warmness, and reflection. These have been distilled from a variety of sources on the topic, including Mackenzie & Stanzione (2010), Anyon et al. (2016), and Way (2011). While not necessarily stated in these four words, the need for clarity, teamwork, warmness, and reflection came up over and over throughout my research.

The following document is meant to be a framework for professional development, and links to the needed materials for each session are provided in links

throughout. It is advised that anyone who wishes to use this outline read over all four sessions first, as some materials are required for this PD.

<b>Session 1: Clarity</b>		
<b>Goals:</b>	Participants will be able to (PWBAT) clearly introduce expectations to learners. PWBAT consistently follow through on consequences.	
<b>Prep</b>	<p><a href="#">Slides</a> Large paper sheets- placed in the center of group tables for groups to write on, and hang on wall, poster style Pencils/Pens</p> <p><a href="#">Handouts</a></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The scenarios for classes may be printed on any paper</li> <li>- <b>Print the roleplay prompts on orange and green paper</b> as they are labeled</li> </ul> <p>Participants should be organized into small groups, ideally around tables. 3-8 per group, depending on the total number of participants.</p>	
5min	<p><b>Ask the opening question:</b> How do students know what is expected in your classroom?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- <b>Instruct</b> participants to write their ideas on the large paper in the center of the table.</li> <li>- give 5 min to brainstorm</li> </ul>	Slide 2
5min	<p>Go through <b>Agenda</b> Go over <b>Goals</b> <b>Discussion Norms</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- <b>Engagement:</b> Participants will be engaged and present</li> <li>- <b>Empathy:</b> Participants are not here to judge each other, but to help each other grow</li> <li>- <b>Inclusion:</b> Participants will work to include each other and make sure everyone's voice has a chance to be heard.</li> <li>- <b>Progress not Perfection:</b> We are all in progress. Don't beat yourself up for not being exactly like you want to be. Mistakes are part of growth.</li> </ul>	Slides 3-5
10min	<p><b>Introductions:</b> Go around the group. Each participant (you included) should say</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Name</li> <li>- Where you work</li> </ul>	Slide 6

	- What you do for fun	
10min	<b>Share:</b> Participants put their papers with brainstorm ideas on the wall. They have 10min to look at other group's ideas, annotate ideas they agree with, and copy down ideas they don't have.	Slide 7
10-15 min	<b>Read off</b> the "confusion creators". <b>Ask:</b> What did we see on our lists that could help with these? Let's start with "Students don't know expectations." What could help solve that? - Repeat with 2nd and 3rd	Slide 8
10min	<b>Exemplars:</b> Assign tables one of the three exemplar readings (Ross and Moving Seats, Joey and the Swivel Chair, Cole and the Raccoon Story). If there are not enough to assign all three readings, fewer may be used.  Tables are to read together, and discuss as they read. They will share some of their findings with everyone at the end - What was done to increase expectation clarity? - Possible answers: Repeat expectations, follow through - What else could they try? Use the lists we made! - Possible answers: Have students practice expectations later, post expectations on walls, give students a chance to complete correctly later  Set the timer for 10min. When time is up, ask for at least one <b>share</b> from each group.	Slide 9
20min  - 10min - 10min	<b>Roleplay practice</b> - <b>Hand out:</b> the roleplay slips (orange and green) - Participants should pair up with someone who has the opposite prompt to them (one "teacher", one "student" per pair). - They have 10min to act out the scene based on their prompts - Swap roles, 10 more minutes for second reversed scene  Reflect as a group: what went well?	Slide 10
15min	<b>Questions?</b>	Slide 11

5min	<b>Goal Setting:</b> what is one way I can apply this?	Slide 12
Further readings	Mackenzie, R. J., & Stanzione , L. (2010). Setting limits in the classroom	

<b>Session 2: Teamwork Communication</b>		
<b>Goals</b>	PWBAT identify their potential team members PWBAT identify what information is important to communicate PWBAT identify how they can communicate info to their teammates	
<b>Prep</b>	Pencils/Pens Paper <a href="#">Handouts</a> <a href="#">slides</a>  Participants should be organized into small groups, ideally around tables. 3-8 per group, depending on the total number of participants.	
10min  - 5min  - 5min	<b>Communication Game</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- All participants find a partner</li> <li>- They are given a pencil and paper</li> <li>- Round 1:               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Partner A is the artist. They must keep their eyes closed.</li> <li>- Partner B may give directions for how to draw the picture.</li> <li>- Prompt 1: Draw a tree</li> </ul> </li> <li>- Round 2               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- swap</li> <li>- Prompt 2: Draw a building</li> </ul> </li> </ul> <p><b>Reflect as a group:</b> what went well? What was difficult?</p> <p><b>Tell:</b> Today is about communication with your teammates. As you can see from this exercise, it's very confusing to do something when you don't know what's expected. When a learner is passed between team members, communication is key so that everyone knows what's going on and what's expected.</p>	Slide 2
5min	Agenda/Norms/Goals	Slide 3-5
20min -10min	<b><u>Jigsaw Discussion</u></b> Discuss with table group <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Who can be part of your team at work?</li> <li>- What do you want your team to communicate to you?</li> </ul>	<b>Slide 6</b>

-10min	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- What are ways you can communicate with your team?</li> </ul> <p>Number off group members</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- (1-6, or whatever is appropriate for the number of participants)</li> <li>- Participants form new groups based on their number.</li> </ul> <p>Each group member should recap what they discussed to their new group.</p>	
5min	<p><b>Case Studies:</b> communication on student meltdown</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Outline how the table works, and explain a scenario.</li> <li>- See slide notes for one scenario response</li> <li>- They will be coming up with communication about student behavior, same as this, in the next activity.</li> </ul>	Slide 7
10min	<p><b>Application:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- <a href="#">handouts</a> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- 15 behavioral scenario prompts</li> </ul> </li> <li>- Each table gets a table handout and a scenario prompt</li> <li>- Brainstorm with their group: what communication needs to happen in this scenario? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Can use the handouts to take notes</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	Slide 8
10min	<p>Groups share summary with everyone</p>	
10min	<p><b>Goal Reflection:</b> everyone shares with their table:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- What went well with your goal?</li> <li>- What do you still need to work on?</li> </ul>	Slide 9
15min	<p><b>Questions?</b></p>	
5min	<p><b>Goal Setting:</b> What is something from today's lesson you can apply this week?</p>	
Further readings	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- <a href="#">"Discipline is Always Teaching": Effective Alternatives to Zero Tolerance in Indiana's Schools. Education Policy Briefs.</a></li> <li>- Setting Limits in the Classroom (ch19)</li> </ul>	



<b>Session 3: Warmness</b>		
<b>Goals</b>	PWBAT build relationships with students PWBAT mitigate the damage of consequences on students	
<b>Prep</b>	<p><a href="#">Slides</a> Large paper sheets- for groups to write on, and hang on wall, poster style Pencils/Pens Print <a href="#">handouts</a></p> <p>Participants should be organized into small groups, ideally around tables. 3-8 per group, depending on the total number of participants.</p>	
5min	<p><b>Brainstorm:</b> what do you do to build student-teacher relationships?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Participants write ideas on large paper in the center</li> </ul>	<b>Slide 2</b>
5min	Agenda/Norms/Goals	<b>Slide 3-5</b>
5min	<p><b>Explain:</b> This is relevant to consequences because...</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Incorrectly done, consequences damage relationships</li> <li>- Harsh consequences-&gt;resentment-&gt;rebellion, not compliance</li> <li>- If consequences are seen as fair, if a teacher is perceived as “competent, caring, and respectful”, behavior improves</li> <li>- Today we will look at how to make consequences caring and respectful</li> </ul>	<b>Slide 6</b>
10min	<p><b>Share:</b> Participants put papers with brainstorm ideas on the wall. They have 10min to look at other group’s ideas, annotate ideas they agree with, and copy down ideas they don’t have.</p>	<b>Slide 7</b>
5min	<p><b>Explain:</b> good consequences are instructive, not punitive. They should teach the student how to reach their goals in an acceptable way.</p> <p>Understand the student’s goal</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Give consequences that keep misbehavior from being rewarded.</li> <li>- Use empathy and instruction to help them find alternative and acceptable paths to goal.</li> </ul>	<b>Slide 8</b>

	<p>Don't damage the relationship:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Keep anger out of it.</li> <li>- Don't hold grudges.</li> <li>- Keep working to build relationships, <i>especially</i> with the kids that struggle with behavior</li> </ul>	
5min	<b>Demonstration:</b> participants read the example from Handout 1 (Instructive Example: Mr. Jordan's Class).	<b>Slide 9</b>
5min	<p><b>Ask:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- What was the goal of the misbehavior?</li> <li>- How were expectations clarified?</li> <li>- What consequences were given?</li> <li>- How did the consequence block the student from their goal?</li> <li>- What was the tone used? Was it angry?</li> </ul>	
10min	<p><b>Practice: Instructions</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Each group will be given one of three scenes with punitive consequences. As a group, rewrite the scene to give consequences that are clear and respectful.</li> <li>- At the end of this time, you will share your solution with the class. You explain your corrections, or act them out as a short scene.</li> </ul> <p>Hand out one of the three punitive examples to each group.</p>	<b>Slide 10</b>
10min	<b>Discuss:</b> call on the groups and ask them to show what they changed and why	
10min	<p><b>Discuss with group:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- What went well with your goal?</li> <li>- What do you still need to work on?</li> </ul>	<b>Slide 11</b>
15min	Questions	<b>Slide 12</b>
5min	<p><b>Reflect:</b> Participants share with their group...</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- What is something from today's lesson you can apply this week?</li> </ul>	<b>Slide 13</b>
<b>Further readings</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Setting Limits in the Classroom (ch5-7)</li> <li>- <a href="#">Building positive relationships with students struggling with mental health</a></li> </ul>	

	- <a href="#">SCHOOL DISCIPLINE AND DISRUPTIVE CLASSROOM BEHAVIOR: The Moderating Effects of Student Perceptions</a>	
--	--	--

<b>Session 4: Reflection</b>		
<b>Goals</b>	PWBAT design logical consequences for behaviors PWBAT facilitate student reflection	
<b>Prep</b>	<a href="#">Handouts</a> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Print orange and green handout slips on the same color paper, and cut into 2 slips each</li> </ul> <a href="#">Slides</a> Pencils/pens <a href="#">Survey</a>	
10min - 5min - 5min	<b>Ask Opening Question:</b> What do the students do when the teacher leaves the room? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- 5min brainstorming</li> <li>- share whole group</li> </ul>	<b>Slide 2</b>
5min	Agenda/Norms/Goals	<b>Slide 3-5</b>
5min	<b>Say:</b> when making <b>Logical Consequences</b> , you need to ask... <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- What was the student's goal?</li> <li>- What did the behavior hurt?</li> <li>- How can they fix this hurt?</li> <li>- What is a different way they can reach this goal?</li> </ul>	Slide 6
10min  5min	For the next activity, we will look over scenarios where logical consequences are used, and review how they answer these questions.  <b>Jigsaw discussion</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Groups will get Handout A or Handout B</li> <li>- 10 min to read and answer</li> <li>- Last question is open ended, where they will practice answering these questions as a group</li> </ul> <b>Share:</b> how were logical consequences used in your reading?	Slide 6

	For the last question, what consequences did you come up with? Why did you design that as a logical consequence?	
5min	<p><b>Explain:</b> Student-driven logical consequences are...</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Very similar to other logical consequences</li> <li>- The main difference is you help the <i>student</i> come up with the answers to the questions from before.</li> </ul>	<b>Slide 7</b>
5min	<p><b>Roleplay Scenario</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Hand out the green and orange scenario slips.</li> <li>- Participants should pair up with someone who has the opposite color to their slip.</li> <li>- They have 5min to act out the scenario</li> </ul>	<b>Slide 7</b>
5min	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Participants should swap roles, and repeat the scene in opposite roles.</li> </ul> <p>Discuss as a group: what went well? What were the struggles?</p>	
15min	<p><b>Discuss with group:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- What went well last time?</li> <li>- What could you use help on?</li> <li>- Brainstorm tips for your fellow group members</li> </ul>	<b>Slide 8</b>
15min	Questions	<b>Slide 9</b>
5min	<p><a href="#">Survey</a></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Participants are given the PD survey. Once they have finished it and handed it to you, they are done!</li> </ul>	Slide 10
Further readings	<a href="#">Restorative Interventions and School Discipline Sanctions in a Large Urban School District</a>	

## Sources

- Anyon, Y., Gregory, A., Stone, S., Farrar, J., Jenson, J. M., McQueen, J., Downing, B., Greer, E., & Simmons, J. (December 2016). Restorative interventions and school discipline sanctions in a large urban school district. *American Educational Research Journal*, 53(6), 1663-1697. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/44245967>
- Darling-Hammond, L., Hyler, M. E., Gardner, M. (2017). *Effective teacher professional development*. Learning Policy Institute. [https://learningpolicyinstitute.org/sites/default/files/product-files/Effective\\_Teacher\\_Professional\\_Development\\_REPORT.pdf](https://learningpolicyinstitute.org/sites/default/files/product-files/Effective_Teacher_Professional_Development_REPORT.pdf)
- Mackenzie, R. J., & Stanzone, L. (July 14, 2010). *Setting limits in the classroom* (3rd ed.) [eBook edition]. Harmony. (ISBN-13 978-0307591722)
- Mezirow, J. (2000). *Learning as transformation: Critical perspectives on a theory in progress*. Jossey-Bass Inc.
- Minahan, J. (March 2019). Building positive relationships with students struggling with mental health. *The Phi Delta Kappan*, 100(6), 56-59. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/26614905>
- Pixabay. (n.d.) <https://pixabay.com/>
- Skiba, R., Rausch, M. K., & Ritter, S. (2004). "Discipline is always teaching": Effective alternatives to zero tolerance in Indiana's schools. *Education Policy Briefs*, 2(3). <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=ED488903>
- Way, S. M. (2011). School discipline and disruptive classroom behavior: The moderating effects of student perceptions. *The Sociological Quarterly*, 52(3), 346-375. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/23027541>